# TD 608 <br> Project Management and Analysis 

Part I<br>Project Conception and Execution



Milind Sohoni
Lecture 8

## Operations Research Problems in Project Execution

Question 1: Suppose that we have a list of tasks $\left\{T_{1}, \ldots, T_{k}\right\}$, where each task $T_{i}$ has a start-time $s_{i}$, and end-time $e_{i}$ and a JCB requirement $r_{i}$ which is a positive integer. We must arrange for JCBs for each of the tasks.

Once a JCB is assigned to a task, it cannot be moved till the task is complete.

| Tasks | T1 | T2 | T3 | T4 | T5 | T6 | T7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Start | 1 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 8 | 10 | 15 |
| End | 5 | 7 | 10 | 8 | 10 | 12 | 18 |
| Req. | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 2 |

- What is the total number of JCBs required for the project?
- What is a valid assignment of the JCBs to the tasks?


## Operations Research Problems in Project Execution

Question 2: Our project has locations $\left\{L_{1}, \ldots, L_{k}\right\}$ and each location $L_{i}$ has demand $d_{i}$ bags of cement per week. There are $r$ vendors $\left\{V_{1}, \ldots, V_{r}\right\}$ of cement. Each vendor can supply no more than $b_{i}$ bags per week. Furthermore, the cost of supply of a bag of cement from vendor $V_{i}$ to location $L_{j}$ is $r_{i j}$. What is an optimal purchase order for each vendor and for each location.


## Question 1 again

Question 1: Suppose that we have a list of tasks $\left\{T_{1}, \ldots, T_{k}\right\}$, where each task $T_{i}$ has a start-time $s_{i}$, and end-time $e_{i}$ and a JCB requirement $r_{i}$ which is a positive integer. We must arrange for JCBs for each of the tasks.

Once a JCB is assigned to a task, it cannot be moved till the task is complete.

| Tasks | T1 | T2 | T3 | T4 | T5 | T6 | T7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Start | 1 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 8 | 10 | 15 |
| End | 5 | 7 | 10 | 8 | 10 | 12 | 18 |
| Req. | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 2 |

- What is the total number of JCBs required for the project?
- What is a valid assignment of the JCBs to the tasks?


## An Observation

Lets look at the input carefully. Order the tasks in increasing order of start times.

| Tasks | T1 | T2 | T3 | T4 | T5 | T6 | T7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Start | 1 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 8 | 10 | 15 |
| End | 5 | 7 | 10 | 8 | 10 | 12 | 18 |
| Req. | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 2 |

We make an activity chart:

| Time | 1.5 | 2.5 | 3.5 | 4.5 | 5.5 | $\ldots$ | 17.5 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :--- | :---: |
| Tasks | T 1 | $\mathrm{~T} 1, \mathrm{~T} 2$ | $\mathrm{~T} 1, \mathrm{~T} 2$ | $\mathrm{~T} 1, \mathrm{~T} 2, \mathrm{~T} 3$ | $\mathrm{~T} 2, \mathrm{~T} 3, \mathrm{~T} 4$ | $\ldots$ | T 7 |
| JCBs | 1 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 6 | $\ldots$ | 2 |

From here, we see that at $t=5.5$ there must be 6 JCBs working. So clearly, a minimum of 6 JCBs are required.

The neat thing is that 6 are sufficient

## The algorithm

| Tasks | T1 | T2 | T3 | T4 | T5 | T6 | T7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Start | 1 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 8 | 10 | 15 |
| End | 5 | 7 | 10 | 8 | 10 | 12 | 18 |
| Req. | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 2 |

So let the JCBs be $J_{1}, \ldots, J_{6}$. Here are the basic steps:

- Prepare a combined list of start and end-times in sorted order. In case of conflict, keep the end-times before the start-times.

| s 1 | s 2 | s 3 | e 1 | s 4 | e 2 | e 4 | s 5 | e 3 | e 5 | s 6 | e 6 | s 7 | 27 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 7 | 8 | 8 | 10 | 10 | 10 | 12 | 15 | 18 |

- Start with the full collection $J_{1}, \ldots, J_{6}$ as the current set of available JCBs.
- For start-times, issue JCBs as per requirements from current set of available JCBs.
- At end-times receive JCBs already issued add to your current set of available JCBs.
- You will never run short!


## A Typical Run

| Tasks | T1 | T2 | T3 | T4 | T5 | T6 | T7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Start | 1 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 8 | 10 | 15 |
| End | 5 | 7 | 10 | 8 | 10 | 12 | 18 |
| Req. | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 2 |


|  | s1 | s2 | s3 | e1 | s4 | e2 | e4 | s5 | e3 | e5 | s6 | e6 | s7 | e7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 7 | 8 | 8 | 10 | 10 | 10 | 12 | 15 | 18 |
|  | -1 | -2 | -2 | +1 | -2 | +2 | +2 | -2 | +2 | +2 | -3 | +3 | -2 | +2 |
| 6 | 5 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 6 | 3 | 6 | 4 | 6 |

## The Schedule

The schedule for each JCB is easily constructed:

|  | s1 | s2 | s3 | e1 | s4 | e2 | e4 | s5 | e3 | e5 | s6 | e6 | s7 | e7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 7 | 8 | 8 | 10 | 10 | 10 | 12 | 15 | 18 |
|  | -1 | -2 | -2 | +1 | -2 | +2 | +2 | -2 | +2 | +2 | -3 | +3 | -2 | +2 |
| 6 | 5 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 6 | 3 | 6 | 4 | 6 |
| J1 | T1 | T1 | T1 | * | T4 | T4 | * | T5 | T5 | * | T6 | * | T7 | * |
| J2 | * | T2 | T2 | T2 | T2 | * | * | T5 | T5 | * | T6 | * | T7 | * |
| J3 | * | T2 | T2 | T2 | T2 | * | * | * | * | * | T6 | * | * | * |
| J4 | * | * | T3 | T3 | T3 | T3 | T3 | T3 | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| J5 | * | * | T3 | T3 | T3 | T3 | T3 | T3 | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| J6 | * | * | * | * | T4 | T4 | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |

- Note that JCB6 is used only for the period 5-8 and never used after that.
- If T6 is delayed by 2 units to $7-10$, that will yield a saving of 1 JCB .
- Thus if the slack permits, this should be done.


## Now to Question 2

Question 2: Our project has locations $\left\{L_{1}, \ldots, L_{k}\right\}$ and each location $L_{i}$ has demand $d_{i}$ bags of cement per week. There are $r$ vendors $\left\{V_{1}, \ldots, V_{r}\right\}$ of cement. Each vendor can supply no more than $b_{i}$ bags per week. Furthermore, the cost of supply of a bag of cement from vendor $V_{i}$ to location $L_{j}$ is $r_{i j}$. What is an optimal purchase order for each vendor and for each location.


## Simpler Question 2

The Assignment Problem: Our project has locations $\left\{L_{1}, \ldots, L_{k}\right\}$ and each location $L_{i}$ has demand 1 bag of cement per week. There are $r$ vendors $\left\{V_{1}, \ldots, V_{r}\right\}$ of cement. Each vendor can supply exactly 1 bag per week. Furthermore, the cost of supply of a bag of cement from vendor $V_{i}$ to location $L_{j}$ is either 1 or $\infty$ (i.e., $V_{i}$ cannot serve location $L_{j}$ ). Compute if the demand can be met at each location, and the vendor which will supply that location.


Solution

## The Solution:Step I

Step I: Construct an initial allocation. This need not be optimal.

- Start with the locations $L_{1}, \ldots, L_{k}$ in any order.
- For every location $L_{i}$ if an unused vendor $V_{i j}$ can be found, the assign that vendor to location $L_{i}$.
- Stop after processing the location list.
- The matching so obtained is called your current matching $M_{1}$. This need not be optimal. Note $L_{4}$ is un-matched.



## Step II

Augmenting path in $M_{1}$ :

- A path in the graph which starts from an unmatched location and goes to an unused vendor.
- It travels from location to vendor along an unmatched edge.
- It goes from vendor to location along a matched edge.

Step II: Look for an augmenting path


## Step III

## Step III: Update the matching to get $M_{2}$

- Make all unmatched edges in the augmenting path as matched.
- Make all matched edges as unmatched.
- This will produce a new matching $M_{2}$ which is of a larger size!



## Finally...

## Step IV: Apply Step II and Step III till no augmenting path is found.

Declare the matching so obtained as the Optimal Matching $M$
Moot Question: How is one to find an augmenting path?

- Reverse all unmatched edges.
- Start from every unserved location $L_{i}$, one at a time.
- See if you can reach an unused vendor by travelling in the graph.


Note that there are many augmenting paths:

- $L_{4} \rightarrow V_{5} \rightarrow L_{3} \rightarrow V_{4}$
- $L_{4} \rightarrow V_{5} \rightarrow L_{3} \rightarrow V_{3}$
- $L_{4} \rightarrow V_{2} \rightarrow L_{2} \rightarrow V_{3}$

