The Complete Project Story so far ...

The Project Document

Chapter 1
- Preamble
- The Survey and Methodology
- Discussion and Conclusions

Chapter 2
- Motivation for the project
- The objectives and the beneficiaries

Appendix I
- The Base-Line-Survey
- The objective-specific Survey

Chapter 3
- List various alternatives
- Through community dialogue, prepare rough plan
- Evaluate in SET (socio-economic-technical)
- Classify as FSR (feasible-sustainable-risky)
- Analyse adverse impacts
- Analyse efficacy
- Choose the project option

Appendix II
- The Community Dialogue
The Building of the Project Plan

Chapter 4 The Project Plan

- The detailed technical plan
- The detailed social arrangements
- The mobilization plan
- The schedule
- The refined analysis

The next objective is the preparation of the Project Plan, which is the most time-consuming and critical part to the success of the project. This requires us to design the transition from the unit plan to the community plan. The community plan must be feasible, sustainable, and least risky on social, economic, and technical grounds, and acceptable to the community.

Appendix III

Obtaining design parameters
Building Consensus
The Building of the Project Plan

Chapter 4 The Project Plan
- The detailed technical plan
- The detailed social arrangements
- The mobilization plan
- The schedule
- The refined analysis

The next objective Preparation of the Project Plan
- most time consuming part
- most critical to the success of the project

This requires us to design the transition from the unit plan to the community plan. The community plan must be:
- feasible, sustainable and least risky
- on social, economic and technical grounds, and
- acceptable to the community
The Building of the Project Plan

The Project Document

Chapter 4 The Project Plan
- The detailed technical plan
- The detailed social arrangements
- The mobilization plan
- The schedule
- The refined analysis

The next objective Preparation of the Project Plan
- most time consuming part
- most critical to the success of the project

This requires us to design the transition from the unit plan to the community plan. The community plan must be
- feasible, sustainable and least risky
- on social, economic and technical grounds, and
- acceptable to the community

An important stage

Appendix III
- Obtaining design parameters
- Building Consensus
Appendix III again

Appendix III

- Obtaining design parameters
- **Building Consensus**

- Who will participate in the project?
- What social arrangements will work?
- Who will help in its implementation?
- Are there any adverse impacts?
- What are the skills and resources?
- Where will the material resources be acquired?
- and many other questions ...

**Methodology: Community meetings!**

- Convey the objectives and the analysis of the planned project.
- Obtain beneficiary feedback on alternatives and options.
- Evolve a consensus on implementation options and schedules.
- Evolve a commitment from the community.
Kitchen Garden again: Meeting 1

Agenda

- Explain
  - project and the state diagram
  - problems—Water, Labour, Land and Cattle
  - benefits if the project works out
  - solution of fence and bakri-pen

- Obtain
  - How many families wish to participate
  - First round of feedback

- Initiate formation of a Working Group
  - Represents the community
  - cross-section of all interests
  - participtes in future meetings
How to hold meetings

This is really an *art*, however there are a few pointers.

**Time**
- must be announced in advance
- must be convenient to community

**Location**
- Within the village/community
- On public land, or if private, then circulate location

**Presence of Trusted Party**
- NGO, social worker, teacher: must be un-alligned
- help in liaison, confidence-building

**Participation of Working Group**
- ensure cross representation
- help in building consensus

**Conduct**
- structured but informal
- present agenda and key speakers
- summarize at the end of meeting

**Homework**
- make notes and publish minutes
- prepare a check-list of items
- prepare a file and a copy for the community.

**Above all**
- Transparency
- People’s Participation
A meeting
And Another
A possible history

Meeting 1, 1st Nov., 2006
- Explain project, cost and benefits, call for participation
- Initiate working group

Meeting 2, 12th Nov., 2006
- Recognize working group
- Outline main social and technical tasks
  - selection of plot, and sub-groups for sub-plots
  - fencing: materials and lengths
  - village permission for drawing water
  - cooperation of cattle and bakri owners
- Identify skills and resources within community
A possible history

Meeting 1, 1st Nov., 2006
- Explain project, cost and benefits, call for participation
- Initiate working group

Meeting 2, 12th Nov., 2006
- Recognize working group
- Outline main social and technical tasks
  - selection of plot, and sub-groups for sub-plots
  - fencing: materials and lengths
  - village permission for drawing water
  - cooperation of cattle and bakri owners
- Identify skills and resources within community

What has been achieved
- The start of a dialogue within the community
- A conceptual framework for analysing options
- A participatory platform for discussion
- An identification within the community of various roles and stakes
- An organizational body for execution

In short, the first steps to a mini-government
Next Meeting

Meeting 3, 25th Nov., 2006

- **List of participants:** 18 families
- **Identification of plot**
- **Discussion on ownership and sub-plots**
  - One acre (40 gunthas), rent-free plot
  - 2 gunthas per family, 4 gunthas common use
- **Discussion on water lifting from pond**
  - 1800 LPD, either manually or using bullock-cart
- **Alternatives for fencing**
  - Mixed-metal and bio-mass, cow-proof
- **bakri-owner arrangement not yet decided**
  - nothing in it for bakri-owner/non-participant
  - too much effort for bakri-owners to control animals
Meeting 3, 25th Nov., 2006

- **List of participants:** 18 families
- **Identification of plot**
  - One acre (40 gunthas), rent-free plot
  - 2 gunthas per family, 4 gunthas for common use
- **Discussion on water lifting from pond**
  - 1800 LPD, either manually or using bullock-cart
- **Alternatives for fencing**
  - Mixed-metal and bio-mass, cow-proof
- **bakri-owner arrangement not yet decided**
  - nothing in it for bakri-owner/non-participant
  - too much effort for bakri-owners to control animals

Tasks for us

- Design the fence
- Analyze the water procurement and storage problem
- Analyze the *bakri* system

The *bakri*-system lies at the heart of the problem.

- What is the cost-benefit analysis of keeping *bakris*?
Rearing goats!


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hours per goat per year (1st year)</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours per goat per year (next years)</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fertility per year</td>
<td>1.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price for 1-year kid</td>
<td>Rs. 1800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fertile age</td>
<td>2-5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milk</td>
<td>100 ml/day</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Study region:** Pakistan: different land quality, skills in animal rearing
- Considerable external skilled support to maintain high fertility and low mortality
- Substantial variation in price per kid: Rs. 600-Rs. 3000
- ”relatively unpredictable and insecure source of income till the herd was built up”
- Considers mortality, knowledge empowerment and social aspects
- Does not consider cost/benefits to environment and agriculture
The 6 goat system

Let us now consider such a system in Shilarwadi at the same parameters as in Pakistan

The 6 goat system has
- 6 goats, each of ages 0-5.
- the goat aged 0,1 do not give milk
- the goats aged 2-5 give kids
- the labour for goat 0 is 100 and for others, it's 200

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hours spent (lst year)</th>
<th>100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hours spent (subsequent)</td>
<td>1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kids generated</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replacement</td>
<td>-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milk</td>
<td>180 lit.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cost-benefit

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Costs (at Rs. 7 /hr )</th>
<th>Rs. 7700</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Costs (at Rs. 10 /hr )</td>
<td>Rs. 10000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits (at Rs. 1800 /kid)</td>
<td>Rs. 9900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milk</td>
<td>180 lit.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We already see that if adult males were to tend goats, then it is already unviable, unless the milk was valued.
More Research

Study:
- Verify the key parameters for the goat system in *Shilarwadi*.
- Account for its impact on agriculture.
- Re-work the goat-system!

Meeting 4, 15th Dec., 2006
- Present your findings on the goat-system.
- Ask for suggestions on the goat-plot interaction.
More Research

Study:

- Verify the key parameters for the goat system in Shilarwadi.
- Account for its impact on agriculture.
- Re-work the goat-system!

Meeting 4, 15th Dec., 2006

- Present your findings on the goat-system.
- Ask for suggestions on the goat-plot interaction.

Finally
Recall...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Farm I.</th>
<th>Fert. and Pest.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FI cost</td>
<td>Rs. 300/yr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supply</td>
<td>100 LPD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour 1</td>
<td>2 HPD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O&amp;M cost</td>
<td>Rs. 300/yr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour 2</td>
<td>1 HPD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output</td>
<td>80kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fodder</td>
<td>xx kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To goat</td>
<td>yy kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Droppings</td>
<td>zz kg</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Exercise**

Compute the numbers xx, yy and zz and new farm-inputs.

Finally
Location of the Growing Season

Exactly which months are the vegetables to be grown?

- Typical vegetables: 70-100 days
- Availability of water
  - Stress after Jan 1.
- Availability of labour
  - Only current agricultural commitments to be considered?
- Availability of bullock-carts
- When are bakris likely to roam free?

Back to the base line survey!
Location of the Growing Season

Exactly which months are the vegetables to be grown?

- Typical vegetables: 70-100 days
- Availability of water
  - Stress after Jan 1.
- Availability of labour
  - Only current agricultural commitments to be considered?
- Availability of bullock-carts
- When are bakris likely to roam free?

Back to the base line survey!

- Clear that Oct-Dec is the 3-month growing period.
- Harvesting is largely over
- Competing agri-activities are threshing and milling which are not very intensive.

18 families in 4 groups implies one woman/youth per group works on the group sub-plot.

i.e., 4 women/youth out of labour-loop for 3 months

- Bullock available for ploughing.
Meeting 5, 25th Dec., 2006

- Agreement on the goat-problem
  - terms for fodder and droppings
  - responsibility on goat-owners

- Agreement on the water issue
  - Storage
  - price of bullock-carts

- Agreement on land and sub-plots

- Agreement on social structure

- Agreement on growing season

What has been achieved

- **Consensus** on major issues
- **Commitments** on key design modalities
- **Clear picture** on key design parameters
Meeting 5, 25th Dec., 2006

- Agreement on the goat-problem
  - terms for fodder and droppings
  - responsibility on goat-owners
- Agreement on the water issue
  - Storage
  - price of bullock-carts
- Agreement on land and sub-plots
- Agreement on social structure
- Agreement on growing season

What has been achieved

- Consensus on major issues
- Commitments on key design modalities
- Clear picture on key design parameters

Exercise: The Water Problem

- Have we budgeted enough water?
- Is the labour allocation adequate?
- What should be the water storage and delivery system?
- What is the social arrangement and is it risky?
- What about the use of bullock-carts?
Consensus and Commitment

Consensus?
- It is an open and informed knowledge of the objectives.
- It is an open and informed knowledge of individual costs and benefits.
- It is not an agreement to conform to a common path.
- **Consensus** is an extremely useful sub-goal and is crucial to the success of the project.
- **Consensus** is only achieved over time through people’s participation and transparency.

Commitment?
- an agreement to supply key resources
  - *Ganpat* will supply 1 acre rent-free for 3 years.
- an agreement to follow the path stated in the consensus
  - *Laxman* will mind his goat.
- It is ultimately based on consensus!
- **Commitment** follows consensus.
- **Commitment** yields key design modalities and parameters.
Recall Appendix III

### Appendix III
- Obtaining design parameters
- Building Consensus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Task</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1st Nov.</td>
<td>Project Outline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Working Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12th Nov.</td>
<td>Main Tasks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Skills and Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25th Nov.</td>
<td>First Solutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First Problem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15th Dec.</td>
<td>Report findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discuss options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25th Dec.</td>
<td>Consensus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commitment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Methodology
- repeated meetings and analysis

### Appendix III contents
- minutes of meetings
- working group members and project participants
- key agreements
- key resources
### Recall Appendix III

#### Appendix III

- Obtaining design parameters
- Building Consensus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1st Nov.</td>
<td>Project Outline Working Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12th Nov.</td>
<td>Main Tasks Skills and Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25th Nov.</td>
<td>First Solutions First Problem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15th Dec.</td>
<td>Report findings Discuss options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25th Dec.</td>
<td>Consensus Commitment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Methodology

- repeated meetings and analysis

### Appendix III contents

- minutes of meetings
- working group members and project participants
- key agreements
- key resources

### It is now that:

- Appendix III is complete
- Project Plan document may be started
Discussion

1. How would a corporate project differ in its procedure for preparing a project plan?

2. Discuss the role of consensus in our procedure. What are the advantages and pitfalls of this procedure?

3. Would you have followed a different procedure?

4. What additional connotation have we attached to consensus and commitment.

5. There frequently are representative bodies (such as panchayat samitis). Should our project be routed through them? Why?

6. Do you think our project is robust enough?