What is Research? (Talk I)

Uday Khedker (www.cse.iitb.ac.in/~uday)

Department of Computer Science and Engineering, Indian Institute of Technology, Bombay



Oct 2017

(日) (四) (코) (코) (코) (코)

Outline

- Why research?
- What is research?
- Where do good ideas come from?
- The process of research
- Richard Hamming on research ("You and Your Research")
- Conclusions



Disclaimers

- General concepts
- No "cook book" or "how to do it yourself"



- General concepts
- No "cook book" or "how to do it yourself"
 - Attempt to explicate what most researchers implicitly believe and may not articulate
 - Views expressed through examples



- General concepts
- No "cook book" or "how to do it yourself"
 - Attempt to explicate what most researchers implicitly believe and may not articulate
 - Views expressed through examples
 - Individual's perspective rather than an organization's perspective



Disclaimers

- General concepts
- No "cook book" or "how to do it yourself"
 - Attempt to explicate what most researchers implicitly believe and may not articulate
 - Views expressed through examples
 - Individual's perspective rather than an organization's perspective
 - Personal reflections and confessions (2)





Part 2

Why Research?

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで

Alice's Adventures





Alice's Adventures



Through the Looking Glass Author: Lewis Carroll Illustration: John Tenniel



Alice's Adventures



Through the Looking Glass Author: Lewis Carroll Illustration: John Tenniel

'Well, in our country,' said Alice, still panting a little, 'you'd generally get to somewhere else – if you ran very fast for a long time, as we've been doing.'

'A slow sort of country!' said the Queen. 'Now, here, you see, it takes all the running you can do, to keep in the same place. *If you want to get somewhere else, you must run at least twice as fast as that!*'

Surviving in a World of Rapidly Developing Technologies

Need to run twice as fast to even remain in the same place

- Hard (Technical) Skills
- Soft Skills

(Leadership, Motivation, Emotional Maturity, Communication etc.)



Surviving in a World of Rapidly Developing Technologies

Need to run twice as fast to even remain in the same place

- Hard (Technical) Skills
- Soft Skills

(Leadership, Motivation, Emotional Maturity, Communication etc.)

• Ability to acquire new skills



Surviving in a World of Rapidly Developing Technologies

Need to run twice as fast to even remain in the same place

- Hard (Technical) Skills
- Soft Skills

(Leadership, Motivation, Emotional Maturity, Communication etc.)

• Ability to acquire new skills

Quick self-learning is enhanced significantly by doing research



Why Do People Do Research?

• Is this the main reason why people do research?



Why Do People Do Research?

- Is this the main reason why people do research?
- We'll hopefully have a better answer by the end of this talk



Part 3

In Search of Research

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで

• Carving Statues out of stones



6/65

- Carving Statues out of stones
- Methods and tools



- Carving Statues out of stones
- Methods and tools
- Attempt to improve the methods and tools leads to
 - Better statues
 - Better methods and tools



- Carving Statues out of stones
- Methods and tools
- Attempt to improve the methods and tools leads to
 - Better statues
 - Better methods and tools
 - Better sculptors



In Search of Research?

- Observed Phenomena with no explanations
 - Puzzles and mysteries
- Lacunae in the known theory and/or practice
 - The need of a better understanding/method
 - Innovative ideas
- Innovative ideas waiting for new applications
 - Discovery of new puzzles, mysteries and/or lacunae



The Essence of Research

• Is building a device, research?







- Is building a device, research?
- Is writing a software, research?



The Essence of Research



• Is writing a software, research?



- Is building a device, research?
- Is writing a software, research?
- Is repairing a device or debugging a software, research?



- Is building a device, research?
- Is writing a software, research?
- Is repairing a device or debugging a software, research?
- Is drawing a conclusion from a lot of data, research?



- Is building a device, research?
- Is writing a software, research?
- Is repairing a device or debugging a software, research?
- Is drawing a conclusion from a lot of data, research?
- Is proving a theorem, research?



- Is building a device, research?
- Is writing a software, research?
- Is repairing a device or debugging a software, research?
- Is drawing a conclusion from a lot of data, research?
- Is proving a theorem, research?
- Is formulating a theorem, research?



The Essence of Research

- Is building a device, research?
- Is writing a software, research?
- Is repairing a device or debugging a software, research?
- Is drawing a conclusion from a lot of data, research?
- Is proving a theorem, research?
- Is formulating a theorem, research?

Research could involve any of the above, or none of the above



The Essence of Research

• Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant



- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action



- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation



- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge



- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge





The Essence of Research

- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowle

Creation of significant & innovative e ideas


- Research is a game of creating innovat significant &
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas
 innovative
 ideas
- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge



The Essence of Research

- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation
- Significance





- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge

Oct 2017



Creation of significant & innovative ideas

The Essence of Research

- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge





- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge

Creation of significant & innovative ideas



The Essence of Research

- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas
- Reflection vs action Creation of Innovation Significance Significance ideas
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge





- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge



- Research is a game of creating innovative ideas that are significant
- Creation of ideas vs. execution of ideas Reflection vs. action
- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge

Creation of significant & innovative ideas





- Innovation
- Significance
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge





What is an Idea?



- An idea is not an isolated thing in a vacuum, it has a context
- The context often decides its significance



- An idea is not an isolated thing in a vacuum, it has a context
- The context often decides its significance
- An idea is like a missing piece in a jigsaw puzzle
 - Discovery of an idea completes at least some part of the puzzle



- An idea is not an isolated thing in a vacuum, it has a context
- The context often decides its significance
- An idea is like a missing piece in a jigsaw puzzle
 - Discovery of an idea completes at least some part of the puzzle Discovery, Invention, or Creation?



- An idea is not an isolated thing in a vacuum, it has a context
- The context often decides its significance
- An idea is like a missing piece in a jigsaw puzzle
 - Discovery of an idea completes at least some part of the puzzle Discovery, Invention, or Creation?
 - An idea is a connection between other ideas



- An idea is not an isolated thing in a vacuum, it has a context
- The context often decides its significance
- An idea is like a missing piece in a jigsaw puzzle
 - Discovery of an idea completes at least some part of the puzzle Discovery, Invention, or Creation?
 - An idea is a connection between other ideas
 - > The more unlikely the connection, the more beautiful the idea is

- An idea is not an isolated thing in a vacuum, it has a context
- The context often decides its significance
- An idea is like a missing piece in a jigsaw puzzle
 - Discovery of an idea completes at least some part of the puzzle Discovery, Invention, or Creation?
 - An idea is a connection between other ideas
 - > The more unlikely the connection, the more beautiful the idea is
- Sometimes, we know what the puzzle would be like before getting the idea Some other times the picture emerges as we start discovering the ideas



- An idea is not an isolated thing in a vacuum, it has a context
- The context often decides its significance



Some other times the picture emerges as we start discovering the ideas



Ingredients of Good Research

Innovation



Ingredients of Good Research

- Innovation
- Aesthetics



Ingredients of Good Research

- Innovation
- Aesthetics
- Other important aspects :
 - Completeness
 - Rigour
 - Empirical demonstration
 - Effective communication





• The sphere of knowledge





- The sphere of knowledge
- Initial general learning





- The sphere of knowledge
- Initial general learning
- Learning increases with time





- The sphere of knowledge
- Initial general learning
- Learning increases with time





- The sphere of knowledge
- Initial general learning
- Learning increases with time
- Begin focussing and specializing





- The sphere of knowledge
- Initial general learning
- Learning increases with time
- Begin focussing and specializing
- Specialize more and more until you reach the unknown





- The sphere of knowledge
- Initial general learning
- Learning increases with time
- Begin focussing and specializing
- Specialize more and more until you reach the unknown
- Try to push the boundary





- The sphere of knowledge
- Initial general learning
- Learning increases with time
- Begin focussing and specializing
- Specialize more and more until you reach the unknown
- Try to push the boundary
- If you keep trying try hard enough, you may succeed





• Your view of knowledge





 Adapted from: The Illustrated Guide to a Ph.D. Matt Might. http://matt.might.net/articles/phd-school-in-pictures/

What Qualifies as Innovation?

- Everything that is new need not be innovative
 - Example: Finding sum of two obscure 100 digit numbers
- Creation without creativity does not qualify as innovation
- The novelty quotient of an innovation depends on
 - how non-obvious the result seemed before you established it
 - how obvious the result appears in hindsight



What Qualifies as Innovation?

- Everything that is new need not be innovative
 - Example: Finding sum of two obscure 100 digit numbers
- Creation without creativity does not qualify as innovation
- The novelty quotient of an innovation depends on
 - how non-obvious the result seemed before you established it
 - how obvious the result appears in hindsight

Innovation in research should enrich the set of "first principles"



Aesthetics

• Total is greater than the sum of the parts

"Scientists study science not because it is useful, but because it is beautiful. Here I do not talk about the beauty of appearance or beauty of qualities ... Here I talk about that **profound beauty which comes from** a harmonious order of parts ..."

- Henry Poincare

• Example : Painting

Proportion of colours Vs. their arrangements

• Casserole design



Aesthetics and Beauty of an Idea



- What proportion of the box does the pink triangle occupy?
- Would the result hold for *any* triangle in a box?



Aesthetics and Beauty of an Idea



• Idea: Draw a vertical line to divide the rectangle in two parts


Aesthetics and Beauty of an Idea



- Idea: Draw a vertical line to divide the rectangle in two parts
- The slanting lines now divide the two boxes in two equal parts



Aesthetics and Beauty of an Idea



- Idea: Draw a vertical line to divide the rectangle in two parts
- The slanting lines now divide the two boxes in two equal parts
- Exactly as much area outside of the triangle as there is inside



Aesthetics and Beauty of an Idea



- Idea: Draw a vertical line to divide the rectangle in two parts
- The slanting lines now divide the two boxes in two equal parts
- Exactly as much area outside of the triangle as there is inside

• Area of a triangle
$$= \frac{1}{2} \times b \times h$$



Food for Thought

What about this pink triangle?





17/65

Beauty of an Idea

• Ideas talk back to us

When we fix one idea, it fixes some other ideas

- · Beauty lies in creating simple ideas that
 - bring in unexpected implications
 - relate the seemingly unrelated things
 - illuminate and reveal much more than anticipated
- Total is greater than the sum of the parts























• Question: What is the sum of all internal angles of a polygon?

• Consider an *n* sided polygon





- Consider an *n* sided polygon
- Choose an arbitrary inner point and connect it to all vertices





- Consider an *n* sided polygon
- Choose an arbitrary inner point and connect it to all vertices
- We have n triangles



- Consider an *n* sided polygon
- Choose an arbitrary inner point and connect it to all vertices
- We have n triangles
- Sum of all angles = $n \cdot 180^{\circ}$





- Consider an *n* sided polygon
- Choose an arbitrary inner point and connect it to all vertices
- We have n triangles
- Sum of all angles $= n \cdot 180^{\circ}$
- Exclude the sum of the angles incident on the chosen point





- Consider an *n* sided polygon
- Choose an arbitrary inner point and connect it to all vertices
- We have n triangles
- Sum of all angles = $n \cdot 180^{\circ}$
- Exclude the sum of the angles incident on the chosen point
- Answer: $(n \cdot 180 360)^{\circ}$





- Rigour removes imprecision and adds concreteness
- Makes an idea immune to personal interpretation



- Rigour removes imprecision and adds concreteness
- Makes an idea immune to personal interpretation
- Example: Divide 6 by 2



- Rigour removes imprecision and adds concreteness
- Makes an idea immune to personal interpretation
- Example: Divide 6 by 2

"Divide 6 into 2 parts and tell me the size of each part"



- Rigour removes imprecision and adds concreteness
- Makes an idea immune to personal interpretation
- Example: Divide 6 by 2 "Divide 6 into 2 parts and tell me the size of each part"
- Divide 6 by $\frac{1}{2}$

"Divide 6 into half part and tell me the size"



- Rigour removes imprecision and adds concreteness
- Makes an idea immune to personal interpretation
- Example: Divide 6 by 2 "Divide 6 into 2 parts and tell me the size of each part"
- Divide 6 by $\frac{1}{2}$

"Divide 6 into half part and tell me the size"

- More rigorous explanations:
 - "Divide 6 into parts of size 2 and tell me the number of parts"
 - "Divide 6 into parts of size ¹/₂ and tell me the number of parts"



Part 4

Where Do Good Ideas Come From?

Based on Where Good Ideas Come From. Steven Johnson. Penguin Books, 2010

(日) (四) (분) (분) (분) 분

What Makes Good Ideas Possible?

We structure our answer along the following aspects:

- The *basis* of good ideas.
- The *domain* of good ideas.
- The *heuristics* of exploring the domain of good ideas.
- The *facilitators* of good ideas.



23/65







• Basis: Available resources

• Domain: Adjacent Possible



23/65

The Basis and the Domain of Good Ideas



- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies

• Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections

• Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible




- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible
 - Boundaries define the limit





- Basis: Available resources with
 - mature prerequisite ideas/technologies
 - flexible connections
 - free flow of ideas
- Domain: Adjacent Possible
 - Boundaries define the limit
 - Boundaries grow as we explore



• First Order Combinations (Stuart Kaufman, 1995)



- First Order Combinations (Stuart Kaufman, 1995)
- Boundaries grow as we explore them

- First Order Combinations (Stuart Kaufman, 1995)
- Boundaries grow as we explore them
 - Find a new door and open it
 - May lead to a yet another door that needs to be opened



- First Order Combinations (Stuart Kaufman, 1995)
- Boundaries grow as we explore them
 - Find a new door and open it
 - May lead to a yet another door that needs to be opened

Car headlights provide only a short lookahead in the night Yet we can cover long distances over time



Some Heuristics for Exploring the Adjacent Possible

- Seeking duality: Observing similarity in apparently unrelated things
- Seeking symmetry: Observing balance or patterned self-similarity
- Generalization: Removing specificities to cover more situations
- Refinement: Distilling to essesnce by removing irrelevant parts
- Extensions: Trying to stretch an idea in all possible directions
- Adaptation: Using an idea in an unrelated context



Adjacent Vs. Non-Adjacent

Charles Babbage's two revolutionary designs

- The Analytical Engine was far ahead of its time
 - All basic ideas were in place in 1837
 - The design was far too complex for the available technology (mechanical gears and switches)



Adjacent Vs. Non-Adjacent

Charles Babbage's two revolutionary designs

- The Analytical Engine was far ahead of its time
 - All basic ideas were in place in 1837
 - The design was far too complex for the available technology (mechanical gears and switches)
- The Difference Engine was well within the bounds of adjacent possible
 - ▶ 15 ton contraption with 25000 mechanical parts
 - Calculating polynomial functions for creating trigonometric tables for navigation

After many improvements, the idea actually transcended the adjacent possible when William Burroughs started mass production in 1844



• Prevailing wisdom circa 1950s : Expressiveness Vs. Efficiency conflict



- Prevailing wisdom circa 1950s : Expressiveness Vs. Efficiency conflict
- John Backus's main observations
 - Economic problem. Imbalence between the programming costs and computer costs
 - Technical difficulty. Inefficiency of translation of an expressive specification
 - Main obstacle. Clumsy treatment of program loops and array address calculations



- Prevailing wisdom circa 1950s : Expressiveness Vs. Efficiency conflict
- John Backus's main observations
 - Economic problem. Imbalence between the programming costs and computer costs
 - Technical difficulty. Inefficiency of translation of an expressive specification
 - Main obstacle. Clumsy treatment of program loops and array address calculations
- Backus was the *right person* at the *right time* at the *right place*
 - He had the foresight to recognize that efficient language implementation was well within the *adjacent possible*
 - He was Bernard Shaw's proverbial "unreasonable person"



- Prevailing wisdom circa 1950s : Expressiveness Vs. Efficiency conflict
- John Backus's main observations
 - Economic problem. Imbalence between the programming costs and computer costs
 - Technical difficulty. Inefficiency of translation of an expressive specification
 - Main obstacle. Clumsy treatment of program loops and array address calculations
- Backus was the *right person* at the *right time* at the *right place*
 - He had the foresight to recognize that efficient language implementation was well within the *adjacent possible*
 - He was Bernard Shaw's proverbial "unreasonable person"
- Creation of FORTRAN is a triumph of the genius of AND over the tyranny of OR



Adaptation

• Using an idea in a completely unrelated context leading to cross fertilization of ideas



Adaptation

- Using an idea in a completely unrelated context leading to cross fertilization of ideas
- Adaptation Example 1:

Screw press for wine making used by Gutenberg for printing press

- Everything else was ready: the movable type face using lead fonts, the ink, the paper,
- the types however were hand pressed and the process was slow and not suitable for mass production



28/65

Adaptation

- Using an idea in a completely unrelated context leading to cross fertilization of ideas
- Adaptation Example 1:

Screw press for wine making used by Gutenberg for printing press

- Everything else was ready: the movable type face using lead fonts, the ink, the paper,
- the types however were hand pressed and the process was slow and not suitable for mass production
- Adaptation Example 2:

French weaver Jacquard's punch card system adopted by Charles Babbage for representing programs



More Adaptation Examples

• Adaptation Example 3:

Guier and Weiffenbach's Sputnik orbit tracing system developed at Applied Physics Laboratory of Johns Hopkins University (Oct 1957)

- The inverse idea used for deciding the trajectory of missile fired from a submarine (discovering the exact location of a submarine using a satellite with known orbit)
- The modern day GPS (Global positioning system)



More Adaptation Examples

• Adaptation Example 3:

Guier and Weiffenbach's Sputnik orbit tracing system developed at Applied Physics Laboratory of Johns Hopkins University (Oct 1957)

- The inverse idea used for deciding the trajectory of missile fired from a submarine (discovering the exact location of a submarine using a satellite with known orbit)
- The modern day GPS (Global positioning system)
- Adaptation Example 4:

Shannon's Master's thesis: A Symbolic Analysis of Relay and Switching Circuits, MIT, 1937

- Digital circuit design was an engineering art with no clear science or mathematics behind them
- Shannon noted that the switches were either open or closed. This coincided nicely with the algebra created by George Boole in 1847



The Facilitators of Discovery of Good Ideas

- The obvious facilitators
 - Curiosity
 - Experimentation
 - Observation
 - Discussion
- Some non-obvious facilitators
 - Slow Hunch
 - Serendipity
 - Error



Slow Hunch

• Every *Eureka!* moment is preceded by a hunch that has lingered on in the mind for a long time before *mutating* into something useful



Slow Hunch

- Every *Eureka!* moment is preceded by a hunch that has lingered on in the mind for a long time before *mutating* into something useful
- Evolution of an idea is not a monotonic progress
 - It's more like a blind man walking with a stick
 - ► Half guesses, some of which are discarded, some are refined further
 - Some times discarded guesses are revisited

Slow Hunch

- Every *Eureka!* moment is preceded by a hunch that has lingered on in the mind for a long time before *mutating* into something useful
- Evolution of an idea is not a monotonic progress
 - It's more like a blind man walking with a stick
 - ► Half guesses, some of which are discarded, some are refined further
 - Some times discarded guesses are revisited
- Example: Darwin's theory of natural selection (Oct 1838)

"favourable variations would be preserved and unfavourable would be destroyed"'

- His autobiography suggests he realized this on 28 Sept 1838 while reading an essay on population by Robert Malthus,
- Historical evidence shows that it evolved over 15 months with early traces of the idea found in his notings in 1937

Serendipity

Word coined by English novelist Horace Walpole (1754), inspired by Persian fairy tale "*Three Princes of Serendip*"

• A happy coincidence, a chance meeting, unexpected connections made by neurons in the dreams

(No wonder coffee table discussions in conferences are more productive than formal presentations) $% \label{eq:constraint}$



Serendipity

Word coined by English novelist Horace Walpole (1754), inspired by Persian fairy tale "*Three Princes of Serendip*"

• A happy coincidence, a chance meeting, unexpected connections made by neurons in the dreams

(No wonder coffee table discussions in conferences are more productive than formal presentations)

• Dream Example 1:

Friedrich Kekule's discovery of the molecular structure of Benzene as a prefect ring of carbon with hydrogen atoms jutting out

Dreamt of a Greek mythological snake Ouroboros eating its own tail



Serendipity

Word coined by English novelist Horace Walpole (1754), inspired by Persian fairy tale "*Three Princes of Serendip*"

• A happy coincidence, a chance meeting, unexpected connections made by neurons in the dreams

(No wonder coffee table discussions in conferences are more productive than formal presentations)

• Dream Example 1:

Friedrich Kekule's discovery of the molecular structure of Benzene as a prefect ring of carbon with hydrogen atoms jutting out Dreamt of a Greek mythological snake Ouroboros eating its own tail

• Dream Example 2:

Dmitri Mendeleev's idea of periodic table ordered by atomic weight



Error

- Error often jolts you out of your comfortable assumptions
- Being right keeps you in place, being wrong forces you to explore



Error

- Error often jolts you out of your comfortable assumptions
- Being right keeps you in place, being wrong forces you to explore
- Error Example 1: Greatbach's pacemaker
 - Original goal was to create a devise to record heart beat
 - A radio like receiver to catch signal's transmitted by heart
 - A wrong resistor connected to oscillator started simulating heart beat

Error

- Error often jolts you out of your comfortable assumptions
- Being right keeps you in place, being wrong forces you to explore
- Error Example 1: Greatbach's pacemaker
 - Original goal was to create a devise to record heart beat
 - A radio like receiver to catch signal's transmitted by heart
 - ► A wrong resistor connected to oscillator started simulating heart beat
- Error Example 2: De Forest's electrodes in a gas filled glass tubes
 - Original experiment involved spark gap transmitter for telegraphy
 - A twisted wire middle electrode resulted in a good amplifier
 - Eventually, it led to a vacuum tube based triode



Part 5

The Process of Research

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで
The Spirit of Inquiry (1)

Very few of us know, how much we have to know,

in order to know,

how little we know



The Spirit of Inquiry (1)

Very few of us know, how much we have to know, in order to know, how little we know



















- Relative stupidity Vs. Productive stupidity
- We are taught to feel bad about relative stupidity
- Productive stupidity:





- Relative stupidity Vs. Productive stupidity
- We are taught to feel bad about relative stupidity
- Productive stupidity:
 - No research is possible unless we are willing to feel vulnerable and stupid





- Relative stupidity Vs. Productive stupidity
- We are taught to feel bad about relative stupidity
- Productive stupidity:
 - No research is possible unless we are willing to feel vulnerable and stupid
 - If we don't feel stupid, we are not trying enough!



The Spirit of Inquiry (1)



- Relative stupidity Vs. Productive stupidity
- We are taught to feel bad about relative stupidity
- Productive stupidity:
 - No research is possible unless we are willing to feel vulnerable and stupid
 - If we don't feel stupid, we are not trying enough!

It's important to know what we know and what we don't and be comfortable with it



- Is asking questions disrepectful?
- Is independent thinking disrepectful?
- Does respect require obedience of thoughts?



The Spirit of Inquiry (2)

- Is asking questions disrepectful?
- Is independent thinking disrepectful?
- Does respect require obedience of thoughts?

We end up mixing

• criticism of an idea with criticism of the person





The Spirit of Inquiry (2)

- Is asking questions disrepectful?
- Is independent thinking disrepectful?
- Does respect require obedience of thoughts?

We end up mixing

- criticism of an idea with criticism of the person
- appreciation of an idea with appreciation of the person



 $(\underline{\circ})$





















Breadth or Depth?





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth



Oct 2017



Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth



36/65

Oct 2017



Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth
































Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth Other areas can be understood on need basis relatively quickly













Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth Other areas can be understood on need basis relatively quickly





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth Other areas can be understood on need basis relatively quickly





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth Other areas can be understood on need basis relatively quickly





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth Other areas can be understood on need basis relatively quickly





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth Other areas can be understood on need basis relatively quickly





Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth Other areas can be understood on need basis relatively quickly













Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth Other areas can be understood on need basis relatively quickly













Achieve depth in one area and overall breadth Other areas can be understood on need basis relatively quickly







































Ability to Abstract and Modularize

- Different levels of abstraction and different granularities of modularization
 - Example : Describing a car to
 - a person who wants to travel in a car
 - a person who wants to drive a car
 - a person who wants to repair a car
 - a person who wants to design a car

Each of the above views is $\ensuremath{\textbf{complete}}$ w.r.t to chosen level of abstraction



From Confusion to Conviction





39/65



Oct 2017

From Confusion to Conviction



Growing Confusion





From Confusion to Conviction







From Confusion to Conviction





From Confusion to Conviction





The "S" Curve of Research Life Cycle



Time/Effort



Pitfalls in Hitting the Productive Zone


Pitfalls in Hitting the Productive Zone



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas

• Research in industry

• Research in academia



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas

- Research in industry
 - Needs to combine results of many idea driven research efforts

• Research in academia



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas

- Research in industry
 - Needs to combine results of many idea driven research efforts
 - Faces the challenge of deployment much more significantly

• Research in academia



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas

- Research in industry
 - Needs to combine results of many idea driven research efforts
 - Faces the challenge of deployment much more significantly
 - Must work with a series of well-defined short term goals
- Research in academia



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas

- Research in industry
 - Needs to combine results of many idea driven research efforts
 - Faces the challenge of deployment much more significantly
 - Must work with a series of well-defined short term goals
 - Focus on an independent idea may be an unaffordable luxury
- Research in academia



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas

• Research in industry

- Needs to combine results of many idea driven research efforts
- Faces the challenge of deployment much more significantly
- Must work with a series of well-defined short term goals
- Focus on an independent idea may be an unaffordable luxury
- Research in academia
 - Typically not bound by a particular product



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas

• Research in industry

- Needs to combine results of many idea driven research efforts
- Faces the challenge of deployment much more significantly
- Must work with a series of well-defined short term goals
- Focus on an independent idea may be an unaffordable luxury
- Research in academia
 - Typically not bound by a particular product
 - Can afford to focus on ideas exclusively



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas

• Research in industry

- Needs to combine results of many idea driven research efforts
- Faces the challenge of deployment much more significantly
- Must work with a series of well-defined short term goals
- ► Focus on an independent idea may be an unaffordable luxury
- Research in academia
 - Typically not bound by a particular product
 - Can afford to focus on ideas exclusively
 - Can work with ill-defined long terms goals
 - Can have longer gestation periods



Product driven research Vs. idea driven research

A product is typically based on a large number of ideas

• Research in industry

- Needs to combine results of many idea driven research efforts
- Faces the challenge of deployment much more significantly
- Must work with a series of well-defined short term goals
- Focus on an independent idea may be an unaffordable luxury
- Research in academia
 - Typically not bound by a particular product
 - Can afford to focus on ideas exclusively
 - Can work with ill-defined long terms goals
 - Can have longer gestation periods

Deliverables exist but of a different nature

Deadlines are usually as strict

Part 6

Richard Hamming on Research

◆□▶ ◆圖▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへで

On the Role of Luck in Research

Pasteur: "Luck favours a prepared mind."

Hamming: "Our society frowns on people who set out to do really good work. You're not supposed to; luck is supposed to descend on you and you do great things by chance. Well, that's a kind of dumb thing to say.

I spoke earlier about planting acorns so that oaks will grow. You can't always know exactly where to be, but you can keep active in places where something might happen.

A prepared mind sooner or later finds something important and does it. So yes, it is luck. *The particular thing you do is luck, but that you do something is not.* "

Luck is when preparation meets opportunity



Turning Difficulties into Opportunities in Research

Knowing right questions is the first step in knowing the answers

Hamming: "Often the great scientists, by turning the problem around a bit, changed a defect to an asset.

Hamming, you think the machines can do practically everything. Why can't you make them write programs?" What appeared at first to me as a defect forced me into automatic programming very early. What appears to be a fault, often, by a change of viewpoint, turns out to be one of the greatest assets you can have. "

Doing research is a test in which you are allowed to write your own question paper and then answer it



The Role of Consolidation through Hard Work in Research

• Research is 1% inspiration and 99% perspiration

Newton: "If others would think as hard as I did, they would get similar results."



The Role of Consolidation through Hard Work in Research

• Research is 1% inspiration and 99% perspiration

Newton: "If others would think as hard as I did, they would get similar results."

Continuous consolidation works like compound interest

Hamming: "Given two people of approximately the same ability and one person who works ten percent more than the other, the latter will more than twice outproduce the former. The more you know, the more you learn; the more you learn, the more you can do; the more you can do, the more the opportunity ..."















The Role of Consolidation through Hard Work in Research

• The physical time remains same but you are able to give deep attention with small conscious effort,

"Getting into the zone" or "Getting into the flow"

• Consolidation through hard work helps you to reduce your conscious effort



- The difference between ordinary and extraordinary is that little extra
- One needs
 - The initiative to find that extra Must be smart and relevant extra, not arbitrary extra (use controlled imagination)
 - > The patience and discipline to keep doing that extra again and again
- Initiative and discipline helps you get into the zone



On the Role of Intelligence and Courage in Research

Hamming: "How about having lots of 'brains?' It sounds good. ...But great work is something else than mere brains.

One of the characteristics you see, and many people have it including great scientists, is that usually when they were young they had independent thoughts and had the courage to pursue them.

Once you get your courage up and believe that you can do important problems, then you can. If you think you can't, almost surely you are not going to. ... That is the characteristic of great scientists; they have courage. They will go forward under incredible circumstances; they think and continue to think. "



On the Role of Drive and Commitment in Research

Hamming: "Well, one of the reasons is drive and commitment. The people who do great work with less ability but who are committed to it, get more done that those who have great skill and dabble in it, who work during the day and go home and do other things and come back and work the next day. They don't have the deep commitment that is apparently necessary for really first-class work. "



On the Role of Commitment and Creativity in Research

Hamming: "If you are deeply immersed and committed to a topic, day after day after day, your subconscious has nothing to do but work on your problem. And so you wake up one morning, or on some afternoon, and there's the answer. For those who don't get committed to their current problem, the subconscious goofs off on other things and doesn't produce the big result.

So ... you don't let anything else get the center of your attention - you keep your thoughts on the problem. Keep your *subconscious* starved so it has to work on your problem, so you can sleep peacefully and get the answer in the morning, free. "



On the Role of Uncertainty in Research

Hamming: "Most people like to believe something is or is not true. Great scientists tolerate ambiguity very well. They believe the theory enough to go ahead; they doubt it enough to notice the errors and faults so they can step forward and create the new replacement theory. If you believe too much you'll never notice the flaws; if you doubt too much you won't get started. It requires a lovely balance. But most great scientists are well aware of why their theories are true and they are also well aware of some slight misfits which don't quite fit and they don't forget it. "



Three Requirements of Creativity

- Deep knowledge
 - Keep your antennas tuned
 - You never know when and where the signals come from
- Holding a problem in the background thinking for a long time without acting on it
- Dealing with loosely structured ideas and structuring them over time



Incremental Research Vs. Fundamental Research

Hamming: "Most great scientists know many important problems. They have something between 10 and 20 important problems for which they are looking for an attack. And when they see a new idea come up, one hears them say 'Well that bears on this problem.'

> The great scientists, when an opportunity opens up, get after it and they pursue it. They drop all other things. They get rid of other things and they get after an idea because they had already thought the thing through. Their minds are prepared; they see the opportunity and they go after it. "



Part 7

Conclusions

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで

The Role of Research in Long Satisfying Technical Career

- In a rapidly changing world, quick self learning is the most important ability
- Quick self learning is enhanced significantly by exposure to research
- Research experience is likely to become more and more important in future



The Essence of Research

- Research is a game of innovative ideas that are significant Even an experimental research begins with an observation and speculation
- The significance of ideas could lie in any of the following:
 - Beauty
 - Utility
 - Enhancement of knowledge
- Research is often a cycle of:

Speculate, design, apply/perform experiment, observe, interpret, infer and repeat



Ingredients of Good Research

- Innovation
- Aesthetics
- Other important aspects :
 - Completeness
 - Rigour
 - Empirical demonstration
 - Effective communication



• What we all may already possess



• What we all may already possess

Motivation, Curiosity, Creativity, Perseverance, Good Grasp



• What we all may already possess

Motivation, Curiosity, Creativity, Perseverance, Good Grasp

• What we may have to acquire with effort



• What we all may already possess

Motivation, Curiosity, Creativity, Perseverance, Good Grasp

• What we may have to acquire with effort

Strong Background

Enhances the effectiveness of all the above traits, particularly when time is a crucial factor


To Be or Not To Be? That is the Question!

- Research is fun!
- Research makes a researcher a much better learner
- Research enables better consolidation of skills
 - Depth of skills
 - The "skill" of applying various skills!

One gets involved with all aspects of solving a particular problem







Why do mountaineers climb mountains?



Why do mountaineers climb mountains?

• Money? Fame? Power? Security?



Why do mountaineers climb mountains?

• Money? Fame? Power? Security? Reply by a mountaineer: Because mountains exist



Why do mountaineers climb mountains?

- Money? Fame? Power? Security? Reply by a mountaineer: Because mountains exist
- Test of mental and physical endurance



Why do mountaineers climb mountains?

- Money? Fame? Power? Security? Reply by a mountaineer: Because mountains exist
- Test of mental and physical endurance
- The real reward?



Why do mountaineers climb mountains?

- Money? Fame? Power? Security? Reply by a mountaineer: Because mountains exist
- Test of mental and physical endurance
- The real reward?

An unforgettable experience of nature in its purest form



• Research is a test of intellectual agility and endurance





- Research is a test of intellectual agility and endurance
- Research is driven by *passion*





- Research is a test of intellectual agility and endurance
- Research is driven by *passion*

Research takes us to a different state of mind





- Research is a test of intellectual agility and endurance
- Research is driven by *passion* Research takes us to a different state of mind
- The cause of the passion may differ
 - Personal goals

 $-\,$ Philanthropic goals. Making a difference by



- Research is a test of intellectual agility and endurance
- Research is driven by *passion* Research takes us to a different state of mind
- The cause of the passion may differ
 - Personal goals
 - Seeking intellectual fun
 - Creating wealth
 - Philanthropic goals. Making a difference by



- Research is a test of intellectual agility and endurance
- Research is driven by *passion* Research takes us to a different state of mind
- The cause of the passion may differ
 - Personal goals
 - Seeking intellectual fun
 - Creating wealth
 - Philanthropic goals. Making a difference by
 - Creating knowledge
 - Solving problems
 - Creating opportunities
 - Changing perceptions



• Solving intellectually challenging problems



- Solving intellectually challenging problems
 - ► Also requires creativity, perseverance, intellectual endurance etc.
 - Also creates a good learning experience



- Solving intellectually challenging problems
 - ► Also requires creativity, perseverance, intellectual endurance etc.
 - Also creates a good learning experience
- However, the questions addressed may not be new (May be new to the person but not to some others)



- Solving intellectually challenging problems
 - ► Also requires creativity, perseverance, intellectual endurance etc.
 - Also creates a good learning experience
- However, the questions addressed may not be new (May be new to the person but not to some others)
- Research addresses questions that have not been addressed before (Or have not been addressed adequately before)



- Solving intellectually challenging problems
 - ► Also requires creativity, perseverance, intellectual endurance etc.
 - Also creates a good learning experience
- However, the questions addressed may not be new (May be new to the person but not to some others)
- Research addresses questions that have not been addressed before (Or have not been addressed adequately before)
- · Research has the potential of making the world better



 $1. \ \mbox{Adapt.}$ Seek extension of an earlier known solution



- $1. \ \mbox{Adapt.}$ Seek extension of an earlier known solution
- 2. If you have a solution, find a problem



- 1. Adapt. Seek extension of an earlier known solution
- 2. If you have a solution, find a problem
- 3. Let slow hunch simmer in your mind



- 1. Adapt. Seek extension of an earlier known solution
- 2. If you have a solution, find a problem
- 3. Let slow hunch simmer in your mind
- 4. Find out the right questions to ask



- 1. Adapt. Seek extension of an earlier known solution
- 2. If you have a solution, find a problem
- 3. Let slow hunch simmer in your mind
- 4. Find out the right questions to ask
- 5. Seek generality by removing specificities



- 1. Adapt. Seek extension of an earlier known solution
- 2. If you have a solution, find a problem
- 3. Let slow hunch simmer in your mind
- 4. Find out the right questions to ask
- 5. Seek generality by removing specificities
- 6. Seek symmetry by testing for duality



- 1. Adapt. Seek extension of an earlier known solution
- 2. If you have a solution, find a problem
- 3. Let slow hunch simmer in your mind
- 4. Find out the right questions to ask
- 5. Seek generality by removing specificities
- 6. Seek symmetry by testing for duality
- 7. Distill the essence by distinguishing the relevant from the irrelevant



- 1. Adapt. Seek extension of an earlier known solution
- 2. If you have a solution, find a problem
- 3. Let slow hunch simmer in your mind
- 4. Find out the right questions to ask
- 5. Seek generality by removing specificities
- 6. Seek symmetry by testing for duality
- 7. Distill the essence by distinguishing the relevant from the irrelevant
- 8. Learn to believe and doubt your ideas at the same time



- 1. Adapt. Seek extension of an earlier known solution
- 2. If you have a solution, find a problem
- 3. Let slow hunch simmer in your mind
- 4. Find out the right questions to ask
- 5. Seek generality by removing specificities
- 6. Seek symmetry by testing for duality
- 7. Distill the essence by distinguishing the relevant from the irrelevant
- 8. Learn to believe and doubt your ideas at the same time
- 9. Build levels of abstractions and migrate between them



- 1. Adapt. Seek extension of an earlier known solution
- 2. If you have a solution, find a problem
- 3. Let slow hunch simmer in your mind
- 4. Find out the right questions to ask
- 5. Seek generality by removing specificities
- 6. Seek symmetry by testing for duality
- 7. Distill the essence by distinguishing the relevant from the irrelevant
- 8. Learn to believe and doubt your ideas at the same time
- 9. Build levels of abstractions and migrate between them
- 10. Mix deep thinking with routine mechanical work



1. Work on important problems



- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems



- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems
- 3. For each problem, identify where you are on the S curve



- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems
- 3. For each problem, identify where you are on the S curve
- 4. Seek excellence and beauty in your work



- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems
- 3. For each problem, identify where you are on the S curve
- 4. Seek excellence and beauty in your work
- 5. Get emotionally involved

(with the process, not with the results. Judge your day by the seeds you sow and not by the harvest you reap)



- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems
- 3. For each problem, identify where you are on the S curve
- 4. Seek excellence and beauty in your work
- 5. Get emotionally involved

(with the process, not with the results. Judge your day by the seeds you sow and not by the harvest you reap)

6. Remain committed



- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems
- 3. For each problem, identify where you are on the S curve
- 4. Seek excellence and beauty in your work
- 5. Get emotionally involved

(with the process, not with the results. Judge your day by the seeds you sow and not by the harvest you reap)

- 6. Remain committed
- 7. Work hard, work continuously


- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems
- 3. For each problem, identify where you are on the S curve
- 4. Seek excellence and beauty in your work
- 5. Get emotionally involved

(with the process, not with the results. Judge your day by the seeds you sow and not by the harvest you reap)

- 6. Remain committed
- 7. Work hard, work continuously
- 8. Consolidate your understanding



- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems
- 3. For each problem, identify where you are on the S curve
- 4. Seek excellence and beauty in your work
- 5. Get emotionally involved

(with the process, not with the results. Judge your day by the seeds you sow and not by the harvest you reap)

- 6. Remain committed
- 7. Work hard, work continuously
- 8. Consolidate your understanding
- 9. Don't depend on luck



- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems
- 3. For each problem, identify where you are on the S curve
- 4. Seek excellence and beauty in your work
- 5. Get emotionally involved

(with the process, not with the results. Judge your day by the seeds you sow and not by the harvest you reap)

- 6. Remain committed
- 7. Work hard, work continuously
- 8. Consolidate your understanding
- 9. Don't depend on luck
- 10. Handle uncertainty and disappointments



- 1. Work on important problems
- 2. Work on multiple problems
- 3. For each problem, identify where you are on the S curve
- 4. Seek excellence and beauty in your work
- 5. Get emotionally involved

(with the process, not with the results. Judge your day by the seeds you sow and not by the harvest you reap)

- 6. Remain committed
- 7. Work hard, work continuously
- 8. Consolidate your understanding
- 9. Don't depend on luck
- 10. Handle uncertainty and disappointments

Also applicable to

- A practising engineer
- A student
- A teacher
- ... in all intellectual pursuits!



Last But Not the Least

Thank You!



Last But Not the Least

Thank You!

Contacting me :

- uday@cse.iitb.ac.in
- http://www.cse.iitb.ac.in/~uday

